
Copyright © ISAZ 2016

This is an Accepted Manuscript of an article published by Taylor & Francis in Anthrozoös on 17 August 2016, available online:
http://www.tandfonline.com/10.1080/08927936.2016.1181374

http://hdl.handle.net/11262/10945
http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/08927936.2016.1181374
Characterising the data in online companion-dog obituaries
to assess their usefulness as source of information about
human-animal bonds.

Abstract

Online pet obituary sites host hundreds of obituaries regarding the passing of
companion animals. Often composed by the owner or primary caretaker of the animal,
they are a potential source of data about human-animal bonds where there were strong
positive human emotions surrounding the animal at point of death. The aim of the
present study was to characterise online pet obituaries and to evaluate their usefulness
as a source of information on the human animal bond. 130 full obituaries of dogs were
studied. Where the role of the writer could be identified, the majority of obituary
writers identified themselves as a female parental figure to the dog (34.6%); however
obituaries were also written by male parental figures (7.7%) and children (5.4%).
Most obituaries (60.0%) fell within the 100-400 word length range. Obituaries were
seen to express several key concepts. For instance, dogs were described as ‘child-
like’, ‘part of the family’, showing ‘sympathy’ and/or “gratitude” to the owner, and
having a ‘sense of humor’. For their part, writers expressed ‘guilt’ over the dog’s
death, discussed a concept of the ‘afterlife’ and noted an ‘instant connection’ between
themselves and the dog. A high proportion of the obituaries discussed the afterlife
(51%) and indicated that the dog was considered part of the family (49%). There were
some significant associations between concept usage within obituaries. Dogs that
were described as ‘childlike’ were more often perceived to be in an ‘afterlife’ and to
have had an ‘instant connection’ with obituary writers  (P<0.001 Chi²=38.08). We
conclude that online pet obituaries can be a valuable source of information on human feelings surrounding a companion animal death.

**Keywords**: companion animals, dogs, euthanasia, human animal bond
Introduction

The bond that humans have with their companion animals can be very strong, with families in Western cultures incorporating companion animals into the family unit and regarding their presence with great significance (Maharaj and Haney 2015, Risley-Curtis 2010). One of the possible negative outcomes of this bond is the grief that can accompany companion animal death. For some individuals, this has been reported as being analogous to the loss of a human companion (Gage and Holcomb 1991, Archer 1997). The stronger the bond between owner and companion animal, the more likely it is that the owner has a higher a ‘death depression’ with both the intensity and number of grief-related symptoms increasing upon the death of a pet (Planchon et al 2002). A study of British pet owners found that 74% of those surveyed reported strong feelings of grief up to a year after a pet’s death (Archer and Winchester 1994). Veterinarians rate delivering the news of an unexpected death of a companion animal as a highly stressful experience, both for themselves and for their clients (Ptacek, Leonard and McKee 2004, DeNayer 2007). Due to the nature of the companion-animal bond and a possible lack of recognition of the importance of a companion animal to the family unit, owners often struggle to interpret and express their grief (Adams Bonnett & Meek 1999). They report struggling with emotions of guilt, sadness and grief and their personal, cultural and religious beliefs can make the loss harder to process. The adverse effects of separation between pet and owner can also impact animal welfare. A review of animal welfare after veterinary treatment (Christiansen and Forkman 2007) has called for more tool sets to help understand the nature of the relationship between human and companion animal. Therefore in this study we set out to investigate a possible novel source of information on the human–companion animal bond.
In sociology, human obituaries are studied to understand collective memory and public attitudes towards individuals and categories of people, e.g. gender (Fowler 2005). For example, a comparison of obituaries for male and female leaders revealed a shift in tone for female leaders. In 1974 they were frequently described as kind and caring, whereas in 1998 they were more likely to be reported as professional and committed, reflecting an overall change in how women are perceived in society (Rodler, Kirchler and Hölzl 2002). By analogy, obituaries for pets may be considered a source of information about people’s attitudes to companion animals, but so far few attempts have been made to quantify the kind of data that may exist, or how useful these data may be in understanding the human-animal bond.

The memorialisation of animals after death is a well established phenomenon, with companion animals being remembered through statues, graves and in verse (Toms 2006). Companion animals are often remembered for qualities that people ascribed to them. Greyfriar’s Bobby, the Cairn Terrier commemorated in statue form in Edinburgh, is remembered for his loyalty to his dead owner, beside whose grave he remained for years. On the other hand, ex Flight Sergeant Lewis, an RAF mascot goat, was buried with full military honours in memory of his bravery during World War Two (Toms 2006). In modern settings remarkable companion animals may occasionally receive printed obituaries. Alex the parrot, trained by animal psychologist Irene Pepperberg, was known for his extensive vocabulary and arithmetic skills. It is interesting to note that The Economist, which runs one obituary per issue, devoted theirs on the week of the 20th September, 2007 to Alex the parrot. In that same week Dame Anita Roddick, the founder of the Body Shop and an ethical
Despite these notable exceptions, printed obituaries of animals are rare. Gravestones and other memorials are expensive and are a form of remembrance limited to those with adequate financial resources. The invention of the internet has given pet owners a public space where they can memorialise their dead pets. Owners can post pictures and a self-written obituary of their companion animal for friends, family and the general public to see. Since online obituaries are not subject to editorial decision about occurrence and content, they will not tell us about how society in general values companion animals. They do, however, reflect the attitudes of the writer, be that the owner or someone else, to the animal. For the subset of cases where the relationship between pet and owner was strong enough for the owner to write an obituary, these obituaries may be a useful data source for research on attitudes to companion animals and address several of the questions raised by Adams, Bonnett and Meek (1999) about how owners reconcile emotions of guilt with cultural and religious beliefs. The broad spectrum of internet usage online means that online obituaries for companion animals potentially represent a rich source of information about the feelings and attitudes of the individuals who composed them. Online sources of data are becoming a useful component of animal welfare research (Nelson and Fijn 2013) and the documentation of the ‘non-human other’ in online environments can be an indicator of the importance attached to the other in human society (Fijn 2007). With this background, the broad aim of this study was to explore and assess the kinds of information contained in online obituaries, focussing on dogs acting in the role of a companion animal. Such obituaries potentially have value as a source of both general information
on the relationships between humans and their companion animals and specific information that might aid in the development of bereavement counselling procedures. Our aim was to collect information on the availability and content of internet sites for pet obituaries, to review the kind of information presented in them and to make a preliminary characterisation of the concepts expressed in them.
**Methods**

As this was an unexplored resource with no information on timescale of uploads, type of dogs featured, types of owners featured, etc. the first task was to obtain an understanding of how pet obituaries were found online and if a general format existed. Grieving owners as prospective obituary writers could be directed to obituaries by surrounding literature, by veterinarians, or by searching the internet for information on pet loss. To establish their informative value on the human-animal bond we aimed to characterise the types of obituary and potential data types held within the text.

Obituary sourcing and recruitment of obituaries: In 2009 the search engine Google was used to locate internet obituary sites using key words ‘pet obituaries’ and ‘dog obituaries’. Obituaries were selected from two online websites that cater to all types of dog, namely Heavenly Paws.Com (http://www.heavenlypaws.com) and Immortal Pets.Com (http://www.immortalpets.com). To be included in the concept study, the obituary had to mention how the animal was obtained and how it died (See Table 1 for list of concepts.). Obituaries that contained no text or only quotations (e.g., verse) were not used. 130 obituaries were included in the study. For each obituary that met the criteria for selection we recorded the number of words in the obituary, role and gender of the obituary writer, and concepts present (see below).

Identification and validation of concepts: We expected that, as with human obituaries, companion animal obituaries would express a number of concepts that reflected the human-animal bond and that these would be useful information that could be sourced from the obituaries. Concepts such as ‘part of the family’, ‘owner guilt’, ‘dog was child-like’, etc. were identified through study of the literature, preliminary observations of the obituary, and in discussion with ethologists and
sociologists. The concepts of interest and their rationale for inclusion are given in Table 1. The concepts initially identified by the authors are described in the results section. Upon exploring the obituaries, the number of concepts expressed within the text was counted. The reliability and robustness of these concepts was tested by recruiting ten participants from students on a Zoology course at the University of Glasgow. Two validation studies were performed, both with naïve subjects. The authors’ selected thirty phrases deemed by the authors to contain the six concepts that required validation. Participants were given no definitions of the concepts beforehand, but were simply asked to indicate which concept best applied to each phrase. Six of the participants were asked to select just one concept for each phrase, while four were allowed to choose more than one concept for each phrase. We would expect to see concepts randomly distributed among the phrases if the concepts were not robust. Chi² tests were used to examine agreement in assignment of concepts to phrases and associations between concepts within obituaries.

Table 1 approximately here
Results

*Availability of internet obituary sites:* Our Google search returned 7 obituary websites on the first page, all active and with no breed restrictions. ImmortalPets.Com offered the cheapest and most comprehensive service. This included a customisable template page, space for several photographs and a guest book for other people who had known the animal to sign. When the owner was unable to pay for hosting, a private sponsor could step in to keep the obituary in place, accompanied by a plea for dog shelters to be supported.

*General characteristics of the obituaries:* The majority of online obituaries feature the deceased dog’s name and photograph. Some were very brief and often included little more than a poem. For the purpose of this study, full obituaries must feature some original writing, but could also include a quotation. Of the 130 full obituaries used in the study, all featured at least one photograph of the pet. In 83 obituaries (64% of total) the obituary writer's role and gender could be identified. The majority of obituary writers (n=45, 54% of obituaries with writers of known gender) identified themselves as a female parental figure to the dog concerned, with other obituaries written by whole families (n=11, 9%), male parental figures (n=10, 8%), child owners (n=7, 6%), couples (n=5, 4%) and unspecified parental figures (n=3, 2%) where gender was not known but the dog was referred to as a child. Obituaries varied in length from <100 to 2,100 with most (n=78, 60%) falling within the 100-400 words range.

*Concepts expressed:* Table 1 describes the concepts identified in the obituaries. Some of these concepts were easy to identify in terms of specific key words, such as...
‘afterlife’. Others were based on a more subjective assessment of obituary texts and these were subjected to the validation tests.

Validation of concepts. Results of the two concept validation studies showed good, statistically significant agreement between subjects and authors for both tests (Single concept test $X^2=134.86$, $P<0.001$, Multiple Concept Test $X^2=97.29$, $P<0.001$). Table 2 looks at the single concept test for the percentage of answers that were concordant with the author’s view. Guilt, Sense of Humor and Instant Connection were all very easily identified. Gratitude and Sympathy were not. However, when looking at the answers, Part of the Family, Gratitude and Sympathy were commonly offered alternatives for each other. In the multi concept test, (Table 2) concordance was higher for all three of these concepts due to the respondents being able to select the alternatives, although gratitude remained the concept with lowest concordance (see discussion).

Afterlife Concept

The most popular concept expressed in the obituaries (n=66, 51% of total) was that the dog was in an afterlife of some type, and perhaps reflects the struggle some owners have reconciling their emotional grief and cultural beliefs. An obituary was noted as expressing this concept whenever keywords such as ‘heaven’, ‘spirit’ or ‘rainbow bridge’ were mentioned. This concept was often used by the obituary writer to mitigate any loneliness the dog might be perceived to be feeling post death, such as within the obituary of Babe Siller:

“As Babe transitions, she will once again chase her squirrels and play fetch the stick with Vernon, who is waiting for her after all these many years. I know
she will be cared for and loved by those who have crossed over before hand.”

Obituary for Babe Siller, accessed 01/06/2008

The idea of reuniting with previously lost pets and family members may be strongly encouraged by the ‘Rainbow Bridge’ poem (https://rainbowsbridge.com/Poem.htm), the text of which describes how a deceased companion animal waits ‘just this side of heaven’ and has access to ‘plenty of food, water and sunshine, and our friends are warm and comfortable’. A curious aspect of the specific Rainbow Bridge mythology is the explicit instruction that this afterlife is not perfect until the pet is rejoined by the owner ‘The animals are happy and content, except for one small thing; they each miss someone very special to them, who had to be left behind.’ Ergo true eternal happiness is not reached until they are reunited with their owner. Likely unintentionally, this has some curious parallels with the now out-of-favour theory of the Limbo of the Infants, where unbaptized infants in the Catholic faith are kept apart from God but not explicitly in hell after their death (Smith 1997). No obituary that used the Rainbow Bridge mythology questioned the ethics of this, or, in the case of adopted animals, entertained doubt as to who the true owner of the pet was. The Afterlife concept was frequently seen alongside obituaries also expressing the child-like concept (X²=11.62, P<0.001), the part of the family concept (X²=5.46, P<0.001), and the sympathy concept (X²=3.29, P<0.05)

Part of the Family Concept

The second most popularly expressed concept within the obituaries was that the pet was part of the family. 49% of the obituaries expressed phrases such as “you were not just a pet, you were much more than that, you were family” and “I have 3 [sic] daughters that called Duke their brother, when I would say your sister is coming [sic]
he would go crazy because he knew one of the girls were on their way coming to the house”. The part of the family concept was unlikely to appear in obituaries that also featured the owner’s guilt surrounding the pet’s death ($X^2=3.36, P=<0.05$), possibly reflecting the difficulty of the euthanasia choice while simultaneously identifying animals as belonging to the family unit.

Child-Like Concept

The child-like concept was considered distinct from ‘part of the family’ when it explicitly put the dog in the child role to the obituary writer, and this concept was expressed in 46% of the obituaries. Considering surrounding literature investigating the human-animal bond this relationship style may be an important predictor for the degree of grief that the human experiences. The child-like concept was negatively associated with obituaries that expressed the sense of humour ($X^2=5.03, P<0.05$) and gratitude concepts ($X^2=6.54, P<0.01$) and occurred often with the instant connection concept ($X^2=3.38, P<0.05$).

Instant Connection Concept

31% of obituaries expressed the ‘instant connection’ concept where the owner talked about ‘love at first sight’ when meeting the dog. This is similar again to the afterlife concept with an expression of fate or design being associated with the owner’s relationship to the dog.

Sympathy Concept
The sympathy concept was noted in 29% of the obituaries when the obituary writer valued the dog’s ability to bring the owner comfort in difficult times. Phrases such as ‘When my ex left me she was there to put her head on my chest and look up at me as if to say “I'm here, and I love you”.’ And “During times I was so ill I didn’t know if I could go on any more he would be there for me, loving me and showing me that I had better not leave him!” Curiously, sympathy was less likely to be associated with concepts that also expressed owner guilt (X2=3.36, P<0.05). While it is one of the least common concepts that arose in the obituaries, it is interesting that a number of obituaries overtly discussed the benefits of the companion animal bond, often in the context of what the owner would miss after the dog’s death.

Guilt Concept

The concept of the owner’s guilt, while only explicitly expressed in 13% of the obituaries, was striking when noted. Phrases such as “I have no idea what happened that day as I wasn’t here. I think I could have saved you from that car.” And “I am so sorry you were in so much pain in the end. You can rest peacefully now.” Guilt may also have been expressed, although was not counted as such, when the owner detailed the clinical observations leading up to the euthanasia of a dog, as if justifying the decision. This emphasises the difficult nature of the euthanasia choice, which has long been acknowledged by veterinarians.

Sense of Humour and Gratitude Concepts

The final two concepts were different, as they were formed prior to the full analysis of obituaries. These were considered to be two common anthropomorphic concepts that occur within successful and unsuccessful human-animal bonds. For example, a lack of
gratitude has been cited as a reason for dog relinquishments (Scarlett et al. 1999).

Sense of humour was noted in 11% of obituaries as “We'll always remember the many
great times, the funny quirks he had” and “She's so funny too. Like one time she
"farted" while walking up the steps, she turned around looked at us, started to walk
back up and farted again! Then she must've got embarrassed and ran up the steps with
out stopping, farting the whole way. Haha!” Gratitude was noted in 9% of obituaries
with phrases such as “You'd let out woof just to tell us you were happy and this was
now your home.” And “Many good times and some bad, you never judged us, you
didn't care you were always thankful for the wonderful parents you had.”
Discussion

Given the rapidly changing nature of the internet and its usage (Zickuhr 2010), it is reasonable to ask why it is important to capture the historical information sources such as online obituaries. Arguably, this service may now be performed via social media accounts given the rise in social media usage in all demographics and user willingness to engage with these communities (Morris Teevan and Panovich 2010). In some respects, academics may always be playing catch up when dealing with non-synchronous message boards such as YouTube and social media (Cheng Dale & Liu, 2008). Therefore this study should principally serve as a proof of concept, that grief felt by many companion animal owners after the death of a companion animal can be expressed in online environments. Furthermore, the expression of this grief relates meaningfully to concepts that occur within the literature surrounding the human-animal bond.

The main aim of this study was to explore on-line pet obituaries as a source of information on the attitudes of owners to dogs as companion animals that might usefully supplement existing sources. We have identified several sources of data within online obituaries and conducted a preliminary exploration of the attitudes expressed in companion animal obituaries. Among the identified sources of data were: the length of text in the obituary, as a possible indicator of time spent, the inclusion of a photograph, as an indicator of breed and physical characteristics of the pet, and the concepts expressed in the text of the obituary itself. This suggests that, with some caveats, online companion animal obituaries could be a useful source of information on the human-animal bond.
With the advent of the internet, people are increasingly documenting their interactions with animals, both domestic and wild. Nelson and Fijn (2013) suggested a methodology for crowd sourcing videos of spontaneous play behaviour from video archive sites such as YouTube. Like us, they utilised concepts from sociology to assess the utility of the video resource. So-called ‘crowd sourcing’ of data on human-animal interactions is a largely untapped potential resource in the field (Nelson & Fijn, 2013). In the present case, although each pet obituary is particular to a specific dog and a specific owner, our results indicate that there are generalisations to be made about the sub-set of owners who choose to express grief at bereavement in this way. We cannot, as yet, generalize from the attitudes expressed here to the pet owning population as a whole; however we would argue that the opinions and feelings expressed by owners on the internet, for example in social media accounts, is a potentially untapped data resource.

Obituaries can be characterised by the grief and loss felt by the owner after the death of a pet. In all the obituaries seen in the course of the study, no obituary expressed joy that a pet had died (although some appreciated a relief from suffering) or was in any way cruel or disparaging of a bereaved owner’s feeling. Many obituaries featured comments from people who also knew the animal. The positive impression that these obituaries deliver suggests that they are typically written by people who have formed strong bonds with their companion animals and as such give us a source of information focussed on this population. It may be that obituary writers are seeking to maintain the strong bond they felt with the animal through its commemoration, and being individually written, these online obituaries do not serve the societal purpose that we would find in traditional human obituaries, e.g. reinforcing gender conformity
Rodler, Kirchler and Holzl 2002). Desmond (2011) related the controversies around
presenting animal obituaries in previously human-dominated environments, and
where there are no great deeds to commemorate, writers of online animal obituaries
may feel safer in this sympathy-orientated space.

We believe there is also an animal welfare aspect to consider. As many studies focus
on relationship breakdown between owner and companion animal, a study of
obituaries might provide a useful comparison for the positive attitudes to the human-
animal bond; it may also inform services such as grief counselling associated with the
death of a pet (e.g., The Argus Institute, Veterinary Teaching Hospital, Colorado State
University.) and veterinarians who specialize in euthanasia. The heavy usage of the
‘Afterlife’ concept within the text of the obituaries supports the findings of studies
which acknowledge considerable grief over the loss of a pet (Gage and Holcomb

Concepts as a tool for understanding obituaries

Quantitative obituary analysis such as this has been used before to establish society’s
view of the deceased and identify trends which are important, (Fowler and Bielsa
2007). The concepts can be used to examine attitudes expressed in the online
obituaries. Our validation test showed they were robust in our sample group, although
identification of phrases defined by the authors as ascribing gratitude to the dog
concerned was problematic. This may be because there is an awareness among the
general pet owning population that gratitude is an inappropriate anthropomorphisation
of the pet, although this was not the only anthropomorphic styled concept. The role of
anthropomorphism should be more greatly considered in future studies. Likewise the
concept of a dog having a ‘sense of humor’ may highlight the prevalence of anthropomorphising companion animals and how this affects the human-animal bond (Serpell 2003, Bradshaw and Casey 2007). For future studies, it may well be necessary to adapt the concepts identified here for the purposes of the investigations underway. Concepts such as ‘Child Like’ bear particular relevance to the human-animal bond, as dogs are capable of forming attachments to humans in a similar fashion to a toddler’s bond with its parent (Topál et al 1998). There are also links between pet owning and the development of empathy (Ascione and Webber 1996, Nibert 1994) and so expressions of empathy within the obituaries could be a useful indicator of how this develops.

**Future use of online companion animal obituary studies.**

Future studies in the human-companion animal field should not ignore online obituaries as a source of information. There are important limitations, such as the financial costs and access to internet, both of which are somewhat mitigated through the use of social media sites which are often accessed via mobile devices in developing countries and across a wide range of demographics (Zickhur 2010). In order to understand what generalisations can be made from this population we need to know more about what kind of owners write obituaries. Contacting obituary writers for more information about social status, income, education, family settings and history would allow us to understand who is likely to write obituaries. If it proves that no particular subset of pet owners writes obituaries then we would be more confident in extending the applications of this study to companion animal studies in general. It should also be noted that there is often a financial cost to using an online obituary service and this may eliminate a subsection of the population from utilising the
obituary resources after a pet’s death. Studies like this one, coupled with further qualitative interviews with the obituary writers, would be the best way of proceeding with the use of pet obituaries as a window into bonds between people and their animals. Obituary study is an inexpensive and easy method of assessing owner attitudes but studies should bear in mind that the obituary is a snapshot in time of the owner’s attitudes at a point after the animal’s death. Such attitudes are dynamic and some obituaries acknowledge this by referencing changing feelings throughout time.

In conclusion, online companion animal obituaries are a free, readily available source of data on the human-animal bond where a positive bond has resulted in grief over the loss of the pet. They may be a useful tool for further assessment of the human-animal bond.
References


Smith J. 1997. The Representation of Limbo in Medieval Drama in *Passions for Place II*, edited by Tymieniecka A. Springer Netherlands


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Rationale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Concepts regarding owner-pet relationship</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child-Like (Dog is child-like to owner)</td>
<td>This aspect of a companion animal is commonly referred to in the literature on human-companion animal relationships (Gage and Holcomb 1991, Neidhart and Boyd 2002)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instant Connection (Upon first meeting there was an instant connection between dog and owner)</td>
<td>A concept reflected in statements such as “love at first sight.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part of the family (Dog is a part of the owner’s family)</td>
<td>Again, this is a common variable used in studies looking at reasons why owners keep or give up their pets (Beck and Katcher 1996, Archer 1997)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Concepts regarding pet’s actions</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sympathy (Dog was a source of sympathy or empathy to owner)</td>
<td>This is seen as an important element in the bond between companion animals and owners (Allen et al 1991, Serpell 2003)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of humor (Dog thought of as funny)</td>
<td>An anthropomorphic term that was clearly expressed in a number of the obituaries.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gratitude (Dog was thought of as displaying gratitude)</td>
<td>Inappropriate expectations of gratitude are thought to be a reason for breakdown of adoptions of rescue dogs, sometimes seen in unexpected pet aggression (Scarlett et al 1999).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Concepts relating to owner’s feelings</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guilt (Owner felt guilty about dog’s death)</td>
<td>Owners often report or display a sense of guilt after deciding on euthanasia for a companion animal (Frommer and Arluke 1999)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afterlife (Owner believes or hopes dog is in an afterlife)</td>
<td>A concept clearly expressed in many obituaries, including reference to the “rainbow bridge”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2 Percentage of answers in single concept test & multiple concept test that agreed with authors’ definition of concepts, broken down by concept.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage Concordant Answers in Single Concept Test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guilt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instant Connection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of humour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part of the Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sympathy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gratitude</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage Concordant Answers in Multiple Concept Test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guilt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instant Connection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of humour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part of the Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sympathy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gratitude</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>